Bugs & Wish list

File gallery, Wikiplugin file; Adding translation parameters for file title | Tiki Wiki CMS Groupware ::
Development
File gallery, Wikiplugin file; Adding translation parameters for file title

Status
    Closed

Subject
    File gallery, Wikiplugin file; Adding translation parameters for file title

Version
    25.x
    26.x

Category
- Feature request
- Developer Training
- Easy for Newbie Dev

Feature
    File Gallery (elFinder or standard UI)
    Wiki Plugin (extends basic syntax)
    i18n (Multilingual, l10n, Babelfish)

Resolution status
    Fixed or Solved

Submitted by
    Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist

Keep informed
    Adrien

Lastmod by
    Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist

Rating
    (0)

Description
    The general translation behaviour for Tiki features is to allow translations of titles and other labels.
    Page title, trackers (title, field names), categories and eventually to allow wiki syntax that allow the
    admin to set TR tags where it is needed (tracker description, wiki page content, etc...).
    But not for Tiki file gallery. ??♂

    The translation of term(s) is found in tiki lang/../language.php or lang/../custom.php

    Following the discussion in the comments the conclusion is:
    1/ There are reasons for this as it may be unwanted to automatically translate terms of a file title
    (file name on import if none is specified).

    2/ To allow translation of file title and file description it will made sense and easier to do it at the
    wiki plugin level, something like:

    ⬚⬚⬚⬚⬚⬚⬚

        {file type="gallery" fileId="1225" browserdisplay="y" translatetitle="y"}

There is no option to display the file description using the plugin and it is not necessary to add one.

Solution
    https://gitlab.com/tikiwiki/tiki/-/merge_requests/1301
    Merged

Importance
    5
Easy to solve?
    7
Priority
    35
Demonstrate Bug (Tiki 19+)
    Please demonstrate your bug on show2.tiki.org

    Version: trunk ▼

Demonstrate Bug (older Tiki versions)
    Please demonstrate your bug on show.tikiwiki.org

    Version: 18.x ▼

Ticket ID
    8062
Created
    Friday 04 February, 2022 10:44:12 GMT-0000
    by Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist
LastModif
    Friday 18 February, 2022 18:18:41 GMT-0000

Comments

hman 04 Feb 22 17:58 GMT-0000

This is kind of problematic, Tikis translation system already fails on numerous occasions due to ambiguity that is rooted in it's blindness to context.

But the idea is IMHO sound. As a first step I would propose to add a language tag (so we know the source language) and have other translations supplied by the uploader (or later on, by other users or the admin)... These could be additional properties, resulting in the addition of language ID and translation as pairs...

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 06 Feb 22 05:49 GMT-0000

Tiki has in context translation since a few month and it is up to admin or power users to use it. ;-)
see: https://dev.tiki.org/Translations-Revamp

But let's not troll this ticket (feel free to start a discussion about your thoughts), why would you think

it be ambiguous to translate the file title (filename) as we do this in so many other areas (wiki page, trackers, menus, categories, etc...) of Tiki ?

hman 06 Feb 22 10:41 GMT-0000

Well, even with a context feature: The context of uploaded file names is -at best- unknown!

The context could be another property of a file name, meaning the uploading user gets asked to select a context from a popup menu, but the admin of a Tiki cannot foresee contexts, because every user is free to upload *anything* in *any* language.

Depending on the content of the Tiki, such a context is potentially completely alien to Tiki, so possibly no usable translation is "at hand". One example to illustrate: Imagine a Tiki about micro biology. My guess is that > 90% of the terms there have no overlap with Tiki terms at all...

Today, only a handful of languages are practically usable with Tiki terms, so an admin would have to trust (blindly!) the outcome of such a translation. Could be okay, could be rubbish.

I believe the best way is to ask the uploader to give translations and/or to enable users (and the admin) to supply them later.

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 09 Feb 22 05:48 GMT-0000

(added description translation)

Sorry, but I don't get it... Let's talk concrete.

First we are talking about website that use Multilingual with restricted or un-restricted list of language.
So there is awareness of multilingual and translation and that's quite important.

Second, If filename were to be translated with "tr" tag (what you call blindly I guess) there will be 3 possibilities:

1. Term(s) doesn't exit in Tiki translation or language custom file => The name is used as is.
2. Term(s) exist in Tiki native translation => IE: File => Fichier => Datei => קובץ)
3. Term(s) exist in language custom file or database (override the Tiki native) => Administrative document => Document administratif => Verwaltungsdokument => מסמך מינהלי)

Does that make sense for you ?
Please, help me to understand where do you see a problem ?

Additionally to solve any problem we can add one of 2 options (may be both but it makes it quite heavy);

1. Make it optional with an option ; "Do you want Tiki to translate the file galleries names and

descriptions ?" (y/n)
2. Use the inContext Tiki feature; add _file to each filename, a file named "name" will became internally "name_file" and seek for the corresponding translation.

I think the optional yes/no is way enough.
Admins will be free to use it or not without risk of overlapping translation.

hman 09 Feb 22 20:46 GMT-0000

You missed the possibility of
4) The term does exist in the translation matrix but is wrong due to context.

What do we do then?

Please bear in mind that translation is dependent on user selection of target language, so has to be assumed unknown to the file uploading user...

Also, in order to translate with Tiki, the file name MUST be in English, this makes English as source language mandatory. But the filename could be any source language...

If the file name is not in English, it must somehow be translated into English for the translation to work...

Therefore I would like to propose that the following be added:
a) a language selector where the file uploader declares the source language
b) a number of N additional names can be appended (as pairs of the translated name and a tag identifying the target language).

In my opinion, no one can translate better than the file uploader. Think of my example with micro biology. How high could the chance be that Tiki transaltes those terms correctly? I am tempted to say 0%...

hman>hman 09 Feb 22 20:57 GMT-0000

Replied to
You...

Let's look at another example, possibly easier to grasp:

A Tiki about international organizations.

Some user might want to upload a doc about the United Nations. That uses the widely know abbreviation UNO (United Nations Organisation), so a doc about the UN might bear the file name "UNO.doc"

French speaking audience might not be fluent in English, but in French the order is reversed, it's Organisation des Nations unies, hence ONU.

Besides the fact that you won't find either of these terms in Tiki matrices, as this term will only be in existence in "international organizations context"...

Also, you must ensure that nothing tries to translate the ".doc" part of the filename...

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 10 Feb 22 07:45 GMT-0000

@hman, thanks for your examples and feedback;

hman wrote:

> *Also, in order to translate with Tiki, the file name MUST be in English, this makes English as source language mandatory.*

You are wrong. (re-tested on Tiki24)
If there is no translation for a term(s) in a specific language it won't be translate for that language but that won't block the translation for another language.
(While we are not talking about strings used in Tiki, the software, it will work the same as long as the string in the English translation file stays commented as it is by default)

IE :
The term "Verwaltungsdokument" is set in Tiki (wiki page) with translation tags.
I create ONLY a translation for French: "Verwaltungsdokument" => "Document administratif",

In French "Verwaltungsdokument" will be translated for "Document administratif".
In any other language (including English) "Verwaltungsdokument" will stay "Verwaltungsdokument".

If there is a translation for a term(s) in the displayed language it will be translated (matching), else it won't be altered.
There will be no reasons the existing behaviour is changed for filenames or descriptions.

---

hman wrote:

> *Some user might want to upload a doc about the United Nations. That uses the widely know abbreviation UNO (United Nations Organisation), so a doc about the UN might bear the file name "UNO.doc" .../... French speaking audience might not be fluent in English, but in French the order is reversed, it's Organisation des Nations unies, hence ONU.*

hman wrote:

> *Besides the fact that you won't find either of these terms in Tiki matrices, as this term will only be in existence in "international organizations context"...*

Dear man, it is already working like this in Tiki and you can find in lang/fr/language.php

"United Nations Organization" => "Organisation des Nations Unies",

For un-translated term(s) we have the "custom translation" system (file or database).
This is what should be used by Admins or Editors to add translations depending of their own usage of Tiki.
In fact this is not exactly translation, it is replacing a string by another on matching.
The following will work (even for the same language);

▢▢▢▢▢▢▢

   "Bernard Tiki Specialist" => "Bernard Tiki Multilingual Specialist",

So I don't get your point here.

Back to the ticket, I would like to remind you that Tiki translation <u>as it is</u>, is working already for most of Tiki features.
Page title, trackers (title, field names), categories, any text surrounded with the TR tags (plugin translate or smarty template) and more... almost anywhere but not on File Gallery (filenames and descriptions) AND it is not optional.

Therefor I think that having the same treatment for the Tiki file gallery AND making the translation optional (off by default); "Do you want Tiki to translate the file galleries names and descriptions ?" (y/n) is even safer than for any other feature.

PS: If you have an issue with the way Tiki translations works, please open a ticket or start a discussion about it, thanks.

hman 10 Feb 22 16:40 GMT-0000

"Dear man, it is already working like this in Tiki and you can find in lang/fr/language.php"

▢▢▢▢▢▢▢

   "United Nations Organization" => "Organisation des Nations Unies",

This will certainly not work on UNO.org...

"Back to the ticket, I would like to remind you that Tiki translation as it is, is working already for most of Tiki features. "

I dare to differ. German is one of the very few language files in Tiki that does have at least some size, but there were more than 10 thousand (!) errors and omissions, so I would say "working for most of Tiki feature" is a bold, but untrue statement. I am sorry I have to say this. Tikis claim that is supports so and so many languages is an exaggerated marketing claim that is way blown out of proportion.

And then I did not even start mentioning the missing tr()... Although some fixes got underway, there is still ample work ahead.

Please don't get me wrong. I have nothing against your proposition, but I believe it would not work sufficiently well, but I liked your idea, so I added a kind of "backup" that can fill in the gaps...

hman 10 Feb 22 17:00 GMT-0000

Side remark: fr/language.php has 10153 lines. My latest de/language.php 15602 lines, and I know I am still missing some thousand lines: Actual tr content in Tiki (18.8) is roughly 20.000 lines. So anything below 20.000 cannot be "working for most of Tiki". See my feature request for a new "generic" language where you can find my automated Tiki extract results.

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 10 Feb 22 18:04 GMT-0000

My proposal correct an "anomaly" about file gallery and it integrates the features in the existing translation workflow.

Most of your comments concern the Tiki Translations model and in general... and how you don't like it. ?

As a kind advise, create a page, open a ticket,propose a discussion about it (Tiki Roundtable Meeting)... do something because complaining will not make things move on. ?

hman 10 Feb 22 22:28 GMT-0000

Well, I'd say writing > 10.000 corrections to the German localization and five tools to aid in creating new localizations is "something" 😎

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 11 Feb 22 06:47 GMT-0000

??

Jean-Marc Libs 13 Feb 22 10:18 GMT-0000

I believe it's not an anomaly. simply adding TRs would automatically translate everything, even titles already in french, even english titles which should not be translated (product names, for instance).

This the reason we don't auto-translate forums, for reasons explained here: https://sourceforge.net/p/tikiwiki/mailman/tikiwiki-devel/thread/2AA6E72C-B1AA-4022-8247-9DB331BE A4A1%40tiki.org/#msg37209613. You should not need to be reminded as you participated in the discussion.

If an example in french makes more sense to you:
When discussion renting apartments in french, if I upload "Location.doc", I do not want Tiki to display "Position.doc" because it's about renting, not geography, and also it's already in french, if there was a

magic auto-translation it should translate for english people!
(there are many more examples in the thread and they all apply)

So, my opinion: this needs to be made optional for each file, it's much harder than simply ask a junior dev to add TRs everywhere.

Jean-Marc Libs 13 Feb 22 10:30 GMT-0000

Jean-Marc Libs wrote:

> *If you have a video for "Working with Explorer" and this is the file title, then obviously the video will be in english.*

I help you to understand that this is not true and more common than you think;
On a site there is a dashboard for mobile made of buttons without text.
I have a video without audio and so the same video can be used for any language however, I want the visitors to see in a list the name and description in their language.

On another site I have one PDF document that contain help in many languages. Same, I want the visitors to see a list of available documents with the name and description in their language.

What is really silly is to "force" a Tiki admin to duplicate the same and in that case upload and manage 10 files if he need to show file title and description in 10 languages.
Something he doesn't need to do for Trackers, Wiki page, Categories, etc... ?

I understand my example was not very good but still, I don't understand your comments...
Let's simplify;

File title : Basic help
File description : This is the basic help
File Id = 1

No translation available (as today)
In all language : "Basic help, This is the basic help" will be displayed and the link goes to file1

After translation in French (custom.php) - my proposal
In French language : "Aide de base, Ceci est l'aide base" will be displayed and the link goes to file1
In all other language : Basic help, This is the basic help will be displayed and the link goes to file1

and so on for all translated language.
Better ?

Jean-Marc Libs 13 Feb 22 21:15 GMT-0000

I was not saying your use case should not be adressed. I was saying addressing your use case should not remove all control from Tiki admins and make my examples impossible to do.

-1 to automatic translations. +1 to optional translations (Tiki admin in control).

The suggestion below seems like it would make everybody happy.

Jean-Marc Libs 13 Feb 22 10:31 GMT-0000

Other idea: add options to the plugin

```
{file type="gallery" fileId="1225" browserdisplay="y" translatetitle="y" translatedescription="y"}
```

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 13 Feb 22 14:15 GMT-0000

Why not...
If this is simpler, very good !!!

IE: Idea of how I use it now

```
{wikiplugin _name=list} {literal} {filter type=file} {filter content=24 field=gallery_id}
{OUTPUT()}<li class="mx-2">{display name="wikiplugin_file" format="wikiplugin"
type="gallery" fileId="object_id" browserdisplay="y"}</li>{OUTPUT}{ALTERNATE()}{tr}Please
add content in your Video tutorials file gallery{/tr}{ALTERNATE} {/literal} {/wikiplugin}
```

If you confirm that's better I'll update the Ticket.

Jean-Marc Libs 13 Feb 22 21:10 GMT-0000

The principle looks better and simpler indeed!

I have not spent enough time to say it's a final specification. Maybe `translatename` would be more
consistent than `translatetitle` because I see the param is called *name* (or ''filename'?). That part
is for someone like you with a real life use case to finalize.

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 14 Feb 22 10:21 GMT-0000

That's the right name.

If you look at : https://dev.tiki.org/tiki-upload_file.php?galleryId=1&fileId=1645 and if you check
the results of the unified-index with {output(template="debug")} "title" is used and not "name".

It is file title so from the user point of view it is better to use "title" and "description" (same as the interface and the search-index)

Thanks for your help, I'm updating the ticket accordingly.

Bernard Sfez / Tiki Specialist 15 Feb 22 15:57 GMT-0000

Thanks both for your help.
Commit done : https://gitlab.com/tikiwiki/tiki/-/merge_requests/1301

Attachments

filename	created	hits	comment	version	filetype

No attachments for this item

The original document is available at
https://dev.tiki.org/item8062-File-gallery-Wikiplugin-file-Adding-translation-parameters-for-file-title