

Bugs & Wish list

Impossible to create menus | Tiki Wiki CMS Groupware :: Development

Impossible to create menus

Status

● Open

Subject

Impossible to create menus

Version

18.x

Category

- Usability
- Bug

Feature

Menu

Resolution status

Confirmed

Submitted by

hman

Lastmod by

Mike Finko

Rating

★★★★★ (1) ?

Related-to

- ● How can elements of a (horiz.) menu be aligned vertically?

Description

When you create a new menu in the admin panel for that (tiki-admin_menus.php) you see the predefined application menu (with ID 42), a popup comes that asks some basics like menu title, description, style etc. When you enter that and click the create button - nothing happens. I would expect the list of menu to contain then two menus, the preexisting application menu and the newly created one. But still, only the preexisting menu is displayed. And no error message...

So it is impossible to create new menus...

hman

Importance

8

Easy to solve?

10 easy

Priority

80

Demonstrate Bug (Tiki 19+)

This bug has been demonstrated on show2.tiki.org

Demonstrate Bug (older Tiki versions)

Ticket ID

7666

Created

Friday 05 February, 2021 18:27:44 GMT-0000

by hman

LastModif

Saturday 27 February, 2021 16:20:06 GMT-0000

Comments



hman 06 Feb 21 14:31 GMT-0000

show.tiki needs to be kicked again, thanks...



Jean-Marc Libs 27 Feb 21 00:58 GMT-0000

show was kicked. For some reason, the show instance was not installed as Tiki18 but as tiki trunk. Which can't run on this server for reasons of PHP compatibility.

<http://hman-11504-7666.show.tikiwiki.org> is now Tiki18
admin password is 12345

Issue is confirmed.

Console logs do not show any error, so I leave this to jQuery experts.



hman 27 Feb 21 09:51 GMT-0000

Sorry, I saw the working show before I read your comment, that's why I wrote "whoever". Thank you. Btw, what's the PHP issue? 18 should run on PHP 7... It's the reason why I have migrated my trusty 12, that I miss so much, to 18 (my ISP charges me extra as long as I keep my webspace on PHP 5).



Jean-Marc Libs 27 Feb 21 22:41 GMT-0000

I was unclear. Trunk does not run on php 5.6. show.tiki.org runs on php 5.6.

The mystery issue was, hman-11504-7666.show.tikiwiki.org tried to auto-install from trunk instead of from Tiki18.



Jonny Bradley 11 Feb 21 10:44 GMT-0000

Hi hman

Can you try this on 21.x please? I don't have access to any 18.x sites any more due to the php version requirements, so cannot easily test it for you.

Things to check would be, have you run setup.sh properly and cleared the tiki and browser caches? If you're using a vis (svn or git) version make sure the composer dependencies are all up to date too.

Maybe someone will be able to look at show at the weekend, i know they're very busy.

My main suggestion would be to upgrade straight to at least 21.x if not 22.x - very little more will get fixed by volunteers in 18.x i'm afraid...



hman 11 Feb 21 16:50 GMT-0000

I did not run setup.sh now, as this Tiki was created on 12.x and subsequently updated to now 18.8 (no svn or git). I always upgrade by downloading the complete Zip, unpacking locally, and uploading everything by FTP. And yes, I did clear caches.

As I wrote on other instances: I can only move a productive Tiki from one stable LTS to another stable LTS. And I cannot consider 18 to be stable. It's (by far!) the worst version of Tiki I have ever seen.

Broken menus is one thing, but there is a legion of bugs in the calendar. If I would not be in a "customer lock-in" situation I would have given up on Tiki altogether. 18 was (and is) simply a nightmare...



hman 11 Feb 21 16:53 GMT-0000

Now there are two show instances in limbo, one on 18 and one on 2x.y.



hman 11 Feb 21 18:33 GMT-0000

The show instance on twenty something decided to cooperate 😊 It needed an index rebuild (which shouldn't be necessary on a fresh install), but after that it decided to run.

Btw, I set PW to 12345.

I created a structure, and then a menu. I could add the menu as a module to pagetop, so seemingly the bug doesn't affect 21x. Now I try some other things that are broken on 18...



hman 11 Feb 21 18:40 GMT-0000

For starters, the calendar still uses hard-coded date US/UK format mm/dd and ignores the pref that defines otherwise. I'll add that to my bug report on the calendar.



hman 13 Feb 21 21:13 GMT-0000

I wanted to find out what was changed in tiki-admin_menus.php from version 18.8 to 22.1, and it aint't much:



```
diff ~/Schreibtisch/tiki-admin_menus188.php ~/Schreibtisch/tiki-admin_menus221.php 5c5 < // (c)
Copyright 2002-2016 by authors of the Tiki Wiki CMS Groupware Project --- > // (c) Copyright by
authors of the Tiki Wiki CMS Groupware Project 38,39c38,39 < if (isset($_REQUEST['remove'])) { <
$access->check_authenticity(tra('Are you sure you want to delete menu id:') . ' ' .
$_REQUEST['remove']); --- > if (isset($_REQUEST['remove']) && $access->checkCsrf(true)) > {
43,44c43 < if (isset($_REQUEST['save'])) { < $access->check_ticket(); --- > if
(isset($_REQUEST['save']) && $access->checkCsrf()) { 66,67c65,67 < if (isset($_REQUEST['reset']))
{ < $access->check_authenticity(tra('Are you sure you want to reset the Application Menu to the
current system default?')); --- > if (isset($_REQUEST['reset']) > && $access->checkCsrf(true)) > {
100,101d99 < < ask_ticket('admin-menus');
```

So whatever makes the difference is probably in the if-clause of the save option. Probably



```
if (isset($_REQUEST['save'])) { $access->check_ticket();
```

ends with an unexpected result, and since there is no (!) code to display an error message, I guess this leads us to the root cause: All the rest of the code for save is absolutely identical, but I am not nearly deep enough into Tiki code to determine this.



hman 13 Feb 21 22:13 GMT-0000

Hm, for testing I commented out \$access->check_ticket(); but it didn't help... Was worth a try.



hman 14 Feb 21 17:09 GMT-0000

New observation: I can clone the application menu (id 42) ! That does work. But - it is no cheap way to work around the utter inability to create new menus: I cannot edit the clone of the application menu. I do get a screen to edit it, can e.g. change the name, and I can click on Save - but then again, nothing happens. Nothing at all, I do not even get an error message. After this operation I have two menus: The

application menu and its clone, and that's it. I'm stuck, I can't do anything, and I have an urgent request from my users to create some drop-down menus for them...



hman 15 Feb 21 09:42 GMT-0000

Next observation: I can enter the panel to change the options of the clone of the application menu. In there, I can remove options (getting the "are you sure" question, and after confirming it, the option disappears).

But this is not permanent. When I then save the options, leave the menu and bring it back up, the removed options magically re-appear...

It seems like menus are in itself write-protected, but I cannot find any pref or permission for that. I am doing this as Admin, and both `tiki_p_edit_menu` and `tiki_p_edit_menu_options` are set for Registered (will remove that later, but for now, it's on) and Admins. I find no other perm or preset controlling this.

And on the show instance with 23.1svc, no one has the `tiki_p_edit_menu` or `tiki_p_edit_menu_options` (doesn't seem to be a default), and still Admin can create and edit menus there...

And even if there is something buried deep that makes menus write-protected, even in that case I would have to look upon this as a bug, because in this case I expect Tiki to display a meaningful, helpful error message...



Jonny Bradley 15 Feb 21 10:37 GMT-0000

Works for me, i just deleted both payment options from your copy of menu 42 - you did click save afterwards didn't you?

There is a warning if you try to leave the page without saving your changes...



hman 15 Feb 21 10:47 GMT-0000

You did that on 23.1svc, didn't you? There are no problems there. It doesn't work on 18.8... And the show instance with 18.8 hangs and needs to be kicked...



John Morris 15 Feb 21 16:29 GMT-0000

Creating menus in 18.x was a nightmare, but once you upgrade to 21.x it's all fine now. Just a lil comment from me. 😊



hman 15 Feb 21 18:27 GMT-0000

From the docs I do not see any difference. All the dialogs seem to be identical? I have played with menus on the 23.1svc of show.tiki.

But on 18.8 it doesn't work at all. All I can do is clone the application menu. Everything else seems write-protected, but I do not get any error messages at all. Looking into the code I see nothing else besides `tiki_p_edit_menus`, and that is granted (I'm Admin anyway). This is totally inexplicable to me.



hman 16 Feb 21 08:52 GMT-0000

Next observation: As a shot in the dark, I uploaded `tiki-admin_menus.php` from 22.1 into my 18.8 installation. This sounds like a really bad idea, but judging from the very little changes (look at the above diff) from 18.8 to 22.1 I figured I would not shoot a "hole" into my DB, but worked solely on the aforementioned copy of the application menu, as a safety precaution.

But everything remains unchanged: I cannot edit the copy of the application menu. That is, I can make changes, e.g. when I click on delete for the Payment option that Jonny describes, it immediately vanishes from the list. I can then click on Save, and I get no error message.

But when I open the edit options dialog again, Payment rises from the dead, miraculously. As I wrote earlier, it looks like a write protection on menus, allowing only cloning, and nothing else. No editing, no new menus. And yes, I have triple checked that `tiki_p_edit_menus` is granted (I am Admin anyway, but the perm is granted to Admins group).



hman 16 Feb 21 10:30 GMT-0000

I took a look at the DB with my ISP's phpMyAdmin. To me this looks decent, there are two entries for menus, which is what the GUI tells me also, and there is the larger table that contains all of the menu options, which references the table of menus. I do not know the structure in detail, but I see no obvious corruption, so it (again) boils down to some permission hiccup inside Tiki... Two screenshots attached.



hman 24 Feb 21 09:51 GMT-0000

Yet another observation: I CAN influence the contents of the "copy of the application menu" by exporting it and importing it back again. I could successfully eliminate the entirety of options by setting the column "remove" to 'y' before importing. I have now managed to create an entirely blank "copy of the application menu". I believe it could be possible to add options by this way, but this is VERY clumsy. Maybe I'll do that in the working show instance with 23.0svc, export it from there, import it here. But I'll have to edit page names, because the show instance doesn't carry the content of my Tiki. And the issue remains that I cannot even change the name of that menu. Maybe I have to hack the DB to achieve this. Oh my goodness. I could do that, but I would not dare tell my users how they could do that (and of course I don't want them to mess with phpMyAdmin, because they don't have the slightest SQL background...).



hman 24 Feb 21 10:20 GMT-0000

Ok, to achieve this, I had to set all optionId to 0 on the export. Then importing WORKED! I now have the menu I want in my Tiki, but has an entirely wrong name ("copy of application menu"), wrong type (d) etc. So I guess I will now have to hack the database...



Mike Finko 24 Feb 21 11:21 GMT-0000

Hi hman, or, can I call you Herman? sounds much more human (no pun intended!)

I suspect the big misunderstanding with why it is "Impossible to Create Menus" is the unclear work flow logic of Tiki. Yes, it is not intuitive on how to create a new, individual menu - read: poor on-boarding of new users :

- 1) crate, menu (add some items. linked pages, etc.)
- 2) than go into Modules and add the menu to that module, put that module in any of 7 locations on the page.

I think better instructions including a pop-up wizard for 'How to create individual menus' would be the simplest ways to resolve this.

br,
Mike



hman 24 Feb 21 11:27 GMT-0000

- 1) crate, menu (add some items. linked pages, etc.)

Step 1 fails. I CANNOT create or edit menus or their options. Period. No error message, but no success either. And yes, tiki_p_edit_menus is granted (I am admin anyway, but the perm IS granted for the admin group).



Mike Finko 24 Feb 21 11:37 GMT-0000

most likely you have already done this, but (given your 'security concerns') test with everything turned off:

- add blockers
- browser 'blockers' (I use Brave, so all the 'shields' and other blockers, with FF turn off 'Enhanced Tracking Protection', accept all cookies, turn all other tracker blockers, JS blockers, etc. off)
- VPN blocker
- firewall blockers
- other security blockers

I suspect this is your issue, in combination with the new, enhanced CSRF security features (they still need a bit more work to find a good balance)

I never experienced "cannot create a menu" (in any version of Tiki). My issues were with the new 'drag & drop' GUI, it did not work well if used with all the 'menu' levels (so only with simple, small menu structures),

br,
Mike



hman 24 Feb 21 11:48 GMT-0000

Sorry, I don't want to offend you, but I have the impression you didn't read the bug report.

NO ad blocker can turn off a PHP function on the server! Despite that, I don't have any ad blocker. This is pure and simple run-off-the-mill Firefox running on Linux Mint.

I am using Tiki since version 1.something (yes, for more than a decade) and I have 30 years of experience in the IT industry, so don't treat me as a newbie. I am professional software tester (ISTQB certified, by the way) and Quality Management Auditor (TÜV certified and DAkkS accredited).

And yes, it is OBVIOUSLY a bug in the code if I can IMPORT a menu but not edit it (or create another, or change its name etc) and do not get an error message indicating WHY the software behaves in the way it does.

The fact that you did not see this doesn't prove anything. Did you even try it on 18.8 ?

On 23.0svc everything works for me, too (which you could have read from this bug report also). But migrating is NOT an option at the moment. It's a bug in an Long Term Service version that still has two years of support.



Mike Finko 24 Feb 21 13:17 GMT-0000

no, I did not read 'thoroughly' though 20+ long threads, just the 'Description' and than skimmed over the threads (since many are technical and I am not a programmer).

unfortunately, the 'Description' does not mentioned 18.8, if it did, I probably would not have interfered.

no, I jumped from 18.7 to 21x because I knew 18x would not get the attention it needed.

I regularly experience issues with browser blockers interfering with the work of Tiki (and other sites) because the default settings are being set much more strict.

- therefore I was only offering an option that no one in this thread mentioned base on my first hand experience (without 30 years experience in the IT business)

Sorry for offending you,
Good Luck!



hman>Mike Finko 24 Feb 21 14:31 GMT-0000

Replied to
no, I did...

"unfortunately, the 'Description' does not mentioned 18.8, if it did, I probably would not have interfered."

Ahem, the version is stated in line two... 😊

How could an ad blocker or a firewall etc. interfere here? They could hinder the display of a result, but only in a way of totally blocking output.

I know no blocker that would interfere with a POST operation, and the refreshing of the screen proves that the POST got carried out. Theoretically a security proxy COULD interfere with the contents of the POST (although I know none that would), but if the sending of the data from client to server succeeded, and the server's response proves that the creation of a menu was not carried out, then no menu was created. No security proxy would fake the output of my own server (okay, it's not my server, but my ISP's, but anyway) to indicate a menu created gets blurred from sight...

Btw, I can also "hard prove" the non-creation by exporting the only two menus that do reside on the server..

I didn't feel offended, just to clear that up. But I have grown allergic against telling people "did you reboot" or the like, so please bear with me 😊

And when it comes to LTS. I know some people here mean me well when recommending a migration, but it's out of the question. When I tell my users that a version that officially still has two years of support is in fact unsupported, then Tiki Wiki will die on the spot, and I get to blame "why did you choose unsupported software". And there is no way my users will accept to hop immediately once new versions appear on the horizon. They WANT software that is settled, because they're expecting (just like I do) that it is better no use only one LTS version behind the current (but in support), because it had more time to enjoy bugfixing. New versions bring new bugs...



hman 24 Feb 21 15:53 GMT-0000

Ok, next observation. I wanted to integrate a small icon into the menus, so I uploaded it into file galleries, and placed an img plugin call into the label of the menu option.

I made a mistake, in that I did not check whether "parse" was set to "y" (it wasn't, just as it wasn't in the original application menu).

Tiki (or probably the underlying system) reacted wildly, immediately losing the DB connection in all tabs I had open... After two minutes the DB connection recovered (possibly my ISP restarted some connector processes to his SAN, but I cannot see or influence those). This reminded me that a DB backup would be a swell idea 😊 Yes, that idea could have come sooner, I know. The last backup was a couple of days old.

Anyway, when all connectors were up again, I saw that "parse" wasn't set to "y", so I will repeat the try to integrate the logo.

Because I was in the database for pulling the backup, I could change the name of the menu I created with the above mentioned "hack" (re-importing the copy of the application menu with all set to remove, and then with the menu items I wanted. On DB level I could change the name (of course I could 😊 which I cannot do with Tiki.

When I did that, I saw that the "copy of the application" menu wasn't really a true copy: where in the original application menu the field "icon" was set to NULL, in the "copy of application menu" the field contained nothing (which, speaking in SQL terms, is NOT the same as NULL). Anyway, setting it to NULL on DB level didn't change anything.

So maybe I'll give the icon in the menu label a second try, now that I have my backup ready 😊



hman 24 Feb 21 16:05 GMT-0000

Hm, nothing happens. I can only add the img fileId=414 on DB level (on Tiki level all my edits still aren't saved). And when I add this in the respective record of tiki_menu_options, I can see it when I enter option edit in Tiki, so it really gets there. But it doesn't display anything, although menu options now are set to be Wiki parsed. Just nothing, no error message.



hman 24 Feb 21 16:26 GMT-0000

In 23.0svc (show instance) adding the img plugin call works as intended...



hman 24 Feb 21 16:30 GMT-0000

Ah, clearing the cache works wonders 😊

But the issue of the menus being non-editable (without going into the database) and non-creatable remains...



hman 27 Feb 21 09:42 GMT-0000

Hey, someone kicked the show instance with Tiki 18! Whoever that was: THANK YOU.

I have now demonstrated the inability to create menus for you. I logged in as Admin, created a test menu with a test menu description, and the result is - nothing at all. Then I went into permissions, and

set tiki_p_edit_menus and tiki_p_edit_menu_options and repeated the menu creation. Again, nothing. See the screenshots, look into the show instance to see for yourself. It is absolutely impossible to create menus on Tiki 18!



Jonny Bradley 27 Feb 21 13:23 GMT-0000

Thanks, confirmed on 18.x but fine on 21+?



hman 27 Feb 21 14:20 GMT-0000

I can't tell, kicking show.tiki.org "unified" the two show instances I created. The other was, I believe, 23.0svc. Menu creation has worked on the other show instance, but I did not take note what version it had been precisely.

I did make a diff between 18.8 & 22.1 tiki-admin-menus.php, see above, and there hardly any differences. Unless the bug lies within those minute changes (which I doubt, because as a test I tried 22.1's file in my 18.8 installation, and it didn't work either) the bug lies deeper than that, which means I cannot even guess.

But since my workaround works (exporting the copy of application menu, setting everything to remove, import-thus create an empty shell of a menu-exporting the menu from the 2something show instance, setting the IDs to 0 and importing into the empty shell) my guess is that it is some permission problem, but not related to tiki_p_edit_menu*.

If importing a menu works, but creating doesn't, the bug has to be some form of permission or other check that fails. And the second bug would be that no meaningful error message is produced...



Jean-Marc Libs 27 Feb 21 22:47 GMT-0000

It is not obvious but if you look very carefully, you will spot that they run on different servers :
<http://hman-11504-7666.show2.tikiwiki.org> → Tiki23
<http://hman-11504-7666.show.tikiwiki.org> → Tiki 18

In case you are curious :

show.tikiwiki.org is the old one, running php 5.6

show2.tikiwiki.org runs whatever Tiki versions require php 7



hman 28 Feb 21 08:24 GMT-0000

There is one thing I noticed: The module "powered by" stopped working on the show2 instance. I went into module configuration, and in the bottom module zone was a module without name ?! which I unassigned. I could not re-asssign "powered by", as that module is missing from the modules list....



Jean-Marc Libs 28 Feb 21 22:33 GMT-0000

Yes.



John Morris 28 Feb 21 15:53 GMT-0000

Hman, I'm just curious, can you upgrade to 21.4 ?

I created a brand new menu successfully in my 21.4. No cloning, but from scratch.



hman 28 Feb 21 16:52 GMT-0000

I can, but I won't. I'm not going to exchange known bugs with unknown bugs. New (younger) versions tend to have more, not less bugs. I was successful to create a menu in the show2 instance, whichever version was in there (I believe it was 23.0svc).



John Morris 02 Mar 21 15:18 GMT-0000

I understand, what I normally do is make a test copy of my live site, update it, and go through it pretty good, I'll spend a day working the plugins, and creating articles and wiki pages, and use the editor function, upload and download, just give it a good run through, I've found in my case anyway, bugs get fixed, and for the most part, it's a much better product, sure, the occasional new bug pops up, but in my experience using Tiki, the upgrades are worth the move to a newer version.

Wish you the best of luck!



hman 02 Mar 21 21:54 GMT-0000

Both of my Tikis contain (literally) hundreds and thousands of user generated content (and I mean content), which I will not risk. Never touch a running system. System gets updated when it gets unsupported.



John Morris 03 Mar 21 13:00 GMT-0000

There's no risk if you make a copy of your live sites, and upgrade them, and use them for awhile. But I get it, I do. Again, good luck with it all! 😊



hman>John Morris 03 Mar 21 22:12 GMT-0000







Replied to There's no... Yeah, no problem. Just copy gigabytes of data on expensive online storage through small bandwidth DSL, move/copy tens of thousands of files, no problem. Moving to Tiki 12 broke my entire layout because Tiki abandoned themes that were canon before. I believe it was Gary who at least made my Tiki 12 run at all. This experience is nothing I will risk again.






hman>hman 22 Feb 22 10:11 GMT-0000

Replied to Yeah, no... A migration to 21 (which I tested) will once again (!) ruin my layout. Tiki 21 is incompatible with CSS built under Tiki 18! My customized version of Gary's Geo (which was dropped from the list of prebuilt CSS when Tiki 12 came. That was the first time a new version of Tiki destroyed my layout) mixes up module zones. Looks like going to bootstrap was a bad decision. So at the moment, going for Tiki 21 is not possible.

Attachments

	filename	created	hits	comment	version	filetype
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-39-24.png	27 Feb 21 09:46 GMT-0000	0	And here I set tiki_p_edit_menu* but even with that: No menu!		
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-39-24.png	27 Feb 21 12:12 GMT-0000	0	And here I set tiki_p_edit_menu* but even with that: No menu!		
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-39-24.png	27 Feb 21 14:01 GMT-0000	0	And here I set tiki_p_edit_menu* but even with that: No menu!		
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-39-24.png	27 Feb 21 14:36 GMT-0000	0	And here I set tiki_p_edit_menu* but even with that: No menu!		
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-39-24.png	27 Feb 21 15:45 GMT-0000	0	And here I set tiki_p_edit_menu* but even with that: No menu!		
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-37-05.png	27 Feb 21 09:44 GMT-0000	0	And this is the result of the menu creation on Tiki 18: Nothing!		

	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-27 10-36-43.png	27 Feb 21 09:43 GMT-0000	0	Here is the dialog to create a new menu on Tiki 18 (show instance)
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-16 11-17-44.png	16 Feb 21 10:31 GMT-0000	0	Screenshot from the DB
	Bildschirmfoto vom 2021-02-16 11-19-15.png	16 Feb 21 10:37 GMT-0000	0	Screenshot from the DB

The original document is available at <https://dev.tiki.org/item7666-Impossible-to-create-menus>