Wiki syntax: Lists inside (larger) paragraphs are rendered as outside

Status
● Open

Subject
Wiki syntax: Lists inside (larger) paragraphs are rendered as outside

Version
15.x

Category
• Bug

Feature
Wiki Syntax (text area, parser, external wiki, etc)

Resolution status
New

Submitted by
Philippe Cloutier

Lastmod by
Philippe Cloutier

Rating
★★★★☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆☆ (0)

Description
Tiki’s syntax allows paragraphs with ordered or unordered lists. For example, the following dummy list items are inside this first paragraph:

• Dummy item 1
• Dummy item 2

Unfortunately, since r28616, parsing such a paragraph generates an HTML P element followed by a distinct HTML UL or OL element. These are rendered as distinct elements, split by as much space as 2 distinct P elements. This can be seen for example in this blog post, stored in Tiki 15 as of 2018-07-31.

Ironically, this problem happens when feature_wiki_paragraph_formatting is enabled, and not when it is disabled. But there is still a problem when feature_wiki_paragraph_formatting is disabled, because as pointed out by Jonny Bradley, the p element cannot contain list elements in HTML 5. This is explicitly documented in the second note of https://www.w3.org/TR/html5/grouping-content.html#the-p-element
As reverting the change would make HTML invalid, the proper solution would be to either hack some CSS which avoids the p element's bottom margin when it is followed by some lists, or to use the div element instead of the p element, as shown in the HTML specification.

Importance
4
Easy to solve?
2
Priority
8
Demonstrate Bug
Please demonstrate your bug on show2.tikiwiki.org

Version: trunk 
Create show2.tikiwiki.org instance

Ticket ID
6738
Created
Friday 03 August, 2018 02:33:19 GMT-0000
LastModif
Monday 03 September, 2018 00:05:10 GMT-0000

Comments

luciaish d' being ♂ 03 Aug 18 09:48 GMT-0000

Hi Philippe, I don't see any bug here. And nothing wrong in your linked blog either. This is the correct behavior imho. Won't fix...

Philippe Cloutier 04 Aug 18 01:38 GMT-0000

Are you saying you think it is the correct behavior to put the paragraph's bottom margin before the list, rather than than at the end of the paragraph?

luciaish d' being ♂ 06 Aug 18 10:33 GMT-0000

Well, essentially I think the ul and ol should be outside the paragraphs as they are currently (and that is the correct behavior) but there should be the same bottom margin on ul and ol as on the paragraphs I guess.
Which is true btw for the journal.css theme. But I see it is being overridden by a more specific class rule from the tiki_base.css:

```
.panel-body ol, .panel-body ul {
    overflow: hidden;
    margin-top: 0;
    margin-bottom: 0;
}
```

That above overrides the following from journal.css line 1406:

```
ul, ol {
    margin-top: 0;
    margin-bottom: 10.5px;
}
```

Philippe Cloutier 03 Sep 18 00:03 GMT-0000

Let's avoid getting technical at this point. The first problem is understanding the logical issue. This issue is about lists inside larger paragraphs. You can see an example of such a list in the Description field of this ticket. If you go to the Edit tab, you will see that the list which contains the 2 dummy items is part of the first paragraph. But in the View tab, this list is displayed as if it was a distinct paragraph. The 2 other examples I provided (blog posts) are the same.

By the way, I am retitling the ticket almost back to what it was originally, since the current title is needlessly technical and restrictive, and wrong.
I just attached a screenshot showing the problem, as it shows on http://www.philippecloutier.com/blogpost88-No-Green-Light-for-Plenom-and-other-Bus ylight-manufacturers-yet

This particular instance has a paragraph which continues after the list, which shows that the problem happens before the list, but not after.

This screenshot was taken on Google Chrome 68, but I don't think this is browser-dependent.

luciaš d' being ‍♂️ 06 Aug 18 10:35 GMT-0000

For the record in the original bug report description you linked different blog post which was not obviously showing the issue you try to point out... Thx for the clarification.

Philippe Cloutier 02 Sep 18 23:56 GMT-0000

That blog post contains a list. That list is inside its introducing paragraph, so it shows the problem just as well.

Attachments

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>filename</th>
<th>created</th>
<th>hits</th>
<th>comment</th>
<th>version</th>
<th>filetype</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List inside paragraph spacing.png</td>
<td>04 Aug 18 01:29 GMT-0000</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>Shows the problem above the list, not below</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The original document is available at https://dev.tiki.org/item6738-Wiki-syntax-Lists-inside-larger-paragraphs-are-rendered-as-outside